

# Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan

Zahir Ebrahim | Project Humanbeingsfirst.org

Monday, January 14, 2014

## Open Letter to Pakistan's Academia, its Stewards, its Beneficiaries

This [Open Letter](#) pertains to the shocking case of the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan I had uncovered in September-October 2011. The plagiarizing physicist had, with great chutzpah, wholesale copied entire physics papers written by others, including by the famous physicist and Nobel laureate of 1918, Max Planck, and reprinted these, near verbatim, under his own name in his two books and in HEC approved journals. The entire plagiarism case, unraveled by Zahir Ebrahim with the courageous assistance of his fellow Pakistani detective-confreere Ehsan Legari, is documented in the following letter to editor:

**[1] Letter to Editor: Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan under the Watchful Eyes of its Distinguished Stewards of Science and Higher Education, By Zahir Ebrahim**

<http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/masterpiece-of-plagiarism-in-pakistan/>

The first paragraph of the aforementioned letter to editor summed up the masterpiece scandal :

“I wish to bring to the notice of the world of academe the bold plagiarism of the work of world’s best known physicist and Nobel laureate of 1918, Max Planck, including verbatim theft from others to build up a padded portfolio of plagiarized publications, and its aiding and abetting by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan through a conspiracy of dunces, inept policies, and a systemic culture of corruption and whitewash wherein Paul protects Peter while they all receive payouts from the public exchequer by bloated anointments as ‘Distinguished National Professor’ and other sainthood.”

Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan By Zahir Ebrahim

That shocking discovery was also submitted to the Supreme Court of Pakistan in Islamabad, twice. for their suo moto notice as a full report after it was hushed up and whitewashed by HEC (it was only wishful thinking of course that the court would take notice on something as “inconsequential” as mere academic plagiarism when the entire Pakistani nation and all its officialdom are plagued with cancers far more immediate):

**[1a] What a load of crap! Letter to to HEC Chairperson, HEC Executive Director, and the senior academics of Pakistan and heads of academic and research institutions, on the whitewashing being done to suppress/downplay the full dimensions of the scandal,**

<https://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/what-a-load-of-crap/>

**[2] Whistleblowing: Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan with system-wide collusion**

**By Zahir Ebrahim** (Download PDF Full Report Recap 140 Pages),

<http://zahirebrahim.files.wordpress.com/2012/02/masterpiece-of-plagiarism-in-pakistan-report-recap.pdf>

The case was summarized in the following oped submitted to mainstream newspapers:

**[3] Summation Letter on Plagiarism Case: Psychopathy requires legal entitlement, not logic or shame, By Zahir Ebrahim**

<http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/10/21/summation-letter-on-plagiarism-case/>

It was followed up with a followup-letter to the Chairperson of HEC, Pakistan's federal governmental body put in charge of regulating higher education throughout Pakistan, the grossly incompetent and highly dubious Higher Education Commission:

**[4] Letter To HEC Chairperson on HEC Coverup By Zahir Ebrahim,**

<http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/11/28/letter-to-hec-chairperson-on-hec-coverup-by-zahir-ebrahim/>

The plagiarism discovery was also submitted to pertinent international journals on science and higher education as Letters:

**[5a] Letter To Editor Nature: Fraud in Science, By Zahir Ebrahim**

<http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/11/22/letter-to-editor-nature-fraud-in-science-by-zahir-ebrahim/>

**[5b] Letter To Editor Nature: An intellectual fraud seldom occurs in a social and intellectual vacuum,** <http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/11/10/letter-to-editor-nature-an-intellectual-fraud-seldom-occurs-in-a-social-and-intellectual-vacuum-by-zahir-ebrahim/>

**[5c] Letter to Editor Science Insider,** <http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/11/04/letter-to-editor-science-insider-by-zahir-ebrahim/>

**[5d] Letter to Editor Chronicle,** <http://zahirebrahim.wordpress.com/2011/11/04/letter-to-editor-chronicle-diederik-stapel-of-netherlands-vs-pakistans-masterpiece-of-plagiarism-by-zahir-ebrahim/>

However, to my surprise, no academic in Pakistan stood up to publicly condemn this travesty.

No newspaper headlined nor inner-paged that discovery.

No one at HEC stood up to take the blame, never mind resigned as an act of conscience at the failure of their own policies that despite the protestations, in fact rewards the villainous pursuit of paper-mills and mediocrity. A full deconstruction of it is in the report submitted to the Supreme Court (see [2] above)

And the most bold chutzpah of it all, the plagiarist, the so called physicist of Pakistan, has written the [following brazen tirade](#), reproduced below.

The one thing I am no longer surprised at in this masterpiece wholesale theft of intellectual property in academic plagiarism is the attitude of the lofty and learned academics of Pakistan, the various Distinguished National Professors, the tenured professors, and the wanna be tenured and DNPs, all sucking off of the gravy-train of HEC, and remaining silent to this travesty.

With the notable exception of physicist Dr. Pervez Hoodbhoy, who is evidently no friend of mine after I had him pegged as the Jewish ventriloquist voice of Daniel Pipes (see [The Niggers of Pakistan](#) ), and one or two other bold academic names who have publicly written in general against HEC's policies in the Dawn and other Pakistani dailies but shrewdly stayed publicly silent on this most grotesque and shocking discovery of plagiarism that was directly aided and abetted by the institutional policies crafted by HEC and its head honchos, no one evidently cared enough to speak up. I do applaud the few names noted in the full plagiarism report who did speak up privately in email. But not sufficiently loud enough, nor boldly enough,

Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan By Zahir Ebrahim

nor accurately enough, to make any difference.

Indeed, of the 110 plus Vice Chancellors and senior academics of Pakistani public and private sector universities who were apprised of this case of plagiarism by yours truly (see the names of these public individuals occupying the highest pulpits of Pakistan's academia in the [plagiarism distribution-list](#)), not one spoke up publicly as far as this scribe is aware.

To the credit of my confrere Ehsan Legari, a non-academic private citizen of Pakistan, who is maligned in the tirade by the plagiarist, was the only person evidently man enough in all of Pakistan to speak up on this egregious theft of intellectual property while all and sundry paid professors of Pakistan just watched silently. Am I permitted an explicative here?

I am writing this [Open Letter](#) to ask the good Pakistani Academic: Do any of you Pakistani academics care that this plagiarist is now boldly living up to the adage after the recent passing away of his friend, protector, and colleague, Professor Riazuddin in Pakistan: ***“ulta chore kotwal ko dante?”*** (translation: thief scolding the judge after being caught red-handed with his hand in the cookie-jar!)

Indeed, it is entirely unsurprising that after Pakistan's number one physicist Dr. Riazuddin's passing away, this mentally deranged plagiarist has now come out lashing against those who caught him red handed. Professor Riazuddin, who was also my friend, was to be my star witness in any hearing before the Supreme Court of Pakistan! See the narrative in the full report (cited [2] above) wherein that cold statement of calling Dr. Riazuddin and all the pertinent Distinguished National Professors of Pakistan sucking off of its gravy-train before the highest court in the land was publicly and un varnishingly made by this scribe.

I am only slightly disappointed in Pakistan's most illustrious academics. I say “slightly” in a most measured tone because I also understand the dynamics of life in Pakistan, the obsession with the price of bread, and other matters of making a good living by the adage ***“Hear no evil, Speak no evil, See no evil”***:



Caption Pakistan's Academe: Hear no evil, Speak no evil, See no evil (image via wiki)

It does take both intellectual and moral courage to speak up --- something that is evidently in abundant short supply in Pakistan. Many of these same academics are absolutely pious, never tell a lie I am sure, never cheat I am equally certain, and guard their own narrow moral interests with utmost jealousy lest these be stolen or compromised; I can surely vouch personally for at least some of them. Many of these academics of Pakistan are my close friends, colleagues, and also teachers. But in that struggle-space for daily bread that is Pakistan, and in-between pious hypocrisies, there is evidently no room for moral courage.

The chutzpatir tirade of the plagiarist is reproduced below. Here is an amusing statement by this sorry fellow: ***"Finally Mr Ehsan Leghari is Mr Zahir Ebrahim's protege , who has been maligning the author and the HEC, for reasons purely mundane as he could not get a slot as an HEC Visiting Faculty Member and was/is condemned to live as a carpetbagger across the pond. An anarchist to boot Mr ZE should not let his Gehenna spillover on others."*** Google [Durrani AND Plagiarism](#).

This evidently newly "traumatized Jew" so piously protesting that "Palestinians are throwing stones at his right to occupy their homeland", is also going around to webmasters and to [Google Groups](#), trying to remove all public references to his being caught red-handed in his villainy by making it sound like those who caught him red handed are the ones at fault: ***"The POST submitted by Mr ZAHIR is grotesque and carries all the marks of a distorted mind---it violates DMCA with impunity, it criminalizes the WIPO laws, it imputes criminally and then its cuts athwart the strict guidelines laid down by the estimable google groups forum. There is absolutely no space on this Forum neither for the UR L nor its malicious and fallacious comments. I entreat you the webmaster, to clear the forum of this trash ASAP. If Drones were not enough the US let loose a daisy cutter in***

***the ungainly form of ZAHIR EBRAHIM with his brand of profane and distorted logic. I am sure you will acquiesce to my request and rip off the URL and the content and make this FORUM a respectable place for exchange of intellect rather than wallow in morbidity of some alien carpetbagger!!”.***

The plagiarist carries on his chutzpah in evidently his 2014 New Year's resolution crusade to get rid of all public references to his being caught with his pants down, on Jan 02, 2014 in Google forum [presspakistan](#): ***“I would like to one last time under pin the fact that posts presented by PressPakistan should conform to the guidelines laid down A case in counter point is ZAHIR EBRAHIM'S OBNOXIOUS POSTING. How it got through the filtering process beats me. It (the post) is full of venom, is totally treacherous and vindictive and cuts athwart all boundaries of civilized human behaviour. It breaks into smithereens the WIPO act, it violates the DMCA which is a crime; ZAHIR commits the crime of imputation . In short the POST is sanguinary and may lead to violence, It would be better to rip it down and/or hang it around ZAHIR's bloated neck. Carpet baggers are traitors in all cases they should be forbidden and be ostracised from interacting with their ex colleagues. IF Z had a grouse with the HEC he should have had the moral courage to come out all guns blazing rather than act as a nondescript mouse eating into the vitals of innocent people. Dr IR Durrani”.*** The posting referred to in that tirade was an early version of the Letter to Editor [1].

Evidently the plagiarist has succeeded because the Letter to Editor has [disappeared](#) from [presspakistan](#). The plagiarist however could not persuade the famous Nizami brothers' new online Pakistani newspaper, Pakistan Today, to remove their column on this plagiarism story written by columnist Umair Javed, titled: The academic epidemic, [March 18, 2012](#): ***“Mr Umair Javed has committed a grave error of judgement .After the passage of 60%of his article a sentence commences with "five months ago --the next 2 sentences concern me and I must say that Mr Zahir Ebrahim has led Umair to the path of sheer travesty. That man Zahir committed criminal DMCA violation and criminal imputation. Had he ( ZE) been here in Pakistan I would have sued him to his last sinew. What UJ has done has violated the Policy and Tos of an estimable NP like PakistanToday. The webmaster or the author himself is requested to delete the three lines concerning me as they comprise of yellow journalism and border on criminality. Thanks. Dr Ijaz Durrani”;*** followed by the threat: ***“UNLESS UMAIR JAVED REDACTS HIS THREE OFFENDING LINES I WILL MOVE THE COURT OF LAW FOR WILFUL DEFAMATION!!”*** ; followed by some more fulminations: ***“I don't even know Umair javed and yet he has the temerity and***

**audacity to defame me. What sort of journalism is that . Is he paid to perform this criminality? UJ is just a waste of space a piece of meat who should have been well left unborn! Than to turn out to be a journalistic scrooge!”**. Read the [column](#) to see what these “three offending lines” are that the plagiarist wants to have cleansed from public memory. And evidently, as of this update, the plagiarist has again brazenly succeeded in having the reference to his name and to his crime of theft of intellectual property removed from even that article; see the [original version on archive.org's WayBackMachine](#). The plagiarist evidently also tried to have Google expunge all references to his crime as shown in [Google's Transparency Report](#). Incredible!

It would not at all surprise me if this plagiarist once again makes an appearance gainfully employed in Pakistan's academia with renewed blessings of the new crop of leaders at HEC. The way the former HEC leadership hushed up the plagiarism scandal in 2011, and its noble beneficiaries living off of its gravy-train managed to keep the scandal out of the press while putting all the blame privately on the plagiarist, something is surely afoot to quietly reinstate the plagiarist as was done once before when the same plagiarist was dismissed for the same crime of intellectual property theft from the Punjab University only to reappear a few years later at the University of Gujrat where I caught him. Well, the shameless fact of the matter as of this update is that this same plagiarist indeed went on to hold other academic positions in Pakistan after he was let go at the University of Gujrat, including as Vice Chancellor of University of South Asia, Lahore! My goodness... **Do I have a crystal ball?** This plagiarist is really plugged into the web of power in Pakistan. What is the value of this glorified white elephant called HEC? The brainchild of the former dictator in-chief of Pakistan, army strongman and president General Pervez Musharaf, and run by his hand picked sycophants and obsequious yes-men at the top who set the precedent for those who have followed them under other political governments, this idiotic and inept institution which has destroyed the higher education system of Pakistan by its foolish and poorly implemented policies that have empirically only fostered academic corruption until this very day, cannot even enforce its own feigned protestations: **“HEC has NEVER condoned any act of plagiarism anywhere. We are all shocked by this blatant act of plagiarism but are certainly not responsible for it. Dr. Durrani alone is responsible for what he has done and not his colleagues, University of Gujrat, HEC etc.”** (see HEC Executive Director's email below). They don't seem to care.

Only the Question of truth can inform on the question of justice, except of course when the Queen is the judge and the Mad Hatter the jury! When untruth prevails, even as glaring a theft as the theft of Palestine when it becomes a fait accompli, is looked upon as the indigenous



Palestinians are the terrorist who exist on their own homeland and the Israelis are the innocent victim of their aggression! An entire generation, maybe two, has been raised in the United States of America with that false belief.



Caption The stone-throwing child scaring the Israelis in Palestine: Yes only in Alice in Wonderland at the Mad Hatter's Unbirthday Party celebrations!

The fact of the matter in this unparalleled masterpiece of academic plagiarism was most self-servingly summed up by the former Executive Director of HEC, Dr. Sohail Naqvi, who conveniently blamed only the plagiarist and most shamelessly white-washed everyone else involved in this unspeakable scandal ([cached image](http://tinyurl.com/Sohail-Naqvi-HEC-defense), <http://tinyurl.com/Sohail-Naqvi-HEC-defense>):

### **Begin Quote**

**From:** Dr. S. Sohail Naqvi [snaqvi@hec.gov.pk](mailto:snaqvi@hec.gov.pk)

**Date:** Fri, Oct 14, 2011 at 10:15 AM

HEC has NEVER condoned any act of plagiarism anywhere. The case has been investigated and immediate action has been taken. We are all shocked by this blatant act of plagiarism but are certainly not responsible for it. Dr. Durrani alone is responsible for what he has done and not his colleagues, University of Gujrat, HEC etc.

Regards



Dr. S. Sohail H. Naqvi

Executive Director

Higher Education Commission

Islamabad, H9

Pakistan

Tel: +92 51 9040 0150

### **End Quote**

Do read the full report ([2] above) submitted to the Supreme Court of Pakistan by this scribe if this letter confuses you, or you are unaware of the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan that directly stops on the doorstep of HEC, Pakistan's lofty Higher Education Commission which has entirely destroyed Pakistan's higher education. While this latter point may be a particular point of view of this author not to be contested before those who have benefited from HEC's policies, but before a sensible and rational court of law with full evidence, you still have the choice of speaking up -- or staying silent -- on the masterpiece of this plagiarism caught by this scribe and analyzed to the point of accurately dissecting its causality. Physicists and scientists, of all peoples, surely must appreciate the fact that focus was forensically moved from the visible effects to highlighting the hidden first cause!

The plagiarist, caught red-handed, is merely the symptom of the corruption in the academic system itself. Any chemotherapy for this cancer can only be effective when the root cause is sensibly targeted --- before the patient is completely comatose or dead! But such potent efficacy cannot be affected by those in the system itself, especially by those who are benefiting from its dysfunction!

Some, even if a handful, in Pakistan's academia must surely still care about truth, regardless of the price of bread and tomatoes. They must surely care what they are teaching to their students by example when their own academicians flourish in plagiarism ridden accolades and paper-mills.

Your students and those who look up to you as role model to pattern their life on, are watching what you do. Not what you say, but what you actually do!

Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan By Zahir Ebrahim

I look forward to the Supreme Court eventually picking up the case --- before all of us are dead --- and if they ever do so while I am alive, some of you may be summoned to testify under oath (if I can have my way). The report is being resubmitted to the highest bench in Pakistan now that a new chief justice has been inaugurated.

The travesty highlighted in this Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan affects us all. And so does pursuing or not pursuing its cure.

Your printing this letter and circulating it in the Pakistani academia is essential for extirpating this primary evil in education from which all else, both good and evil, naturally follow.

Please download the full report PDF and share with your students and colleagues. Post this letter on your website.

But do you even dare to break your shameless silence?

Here is the shameless chutzpah of the plagiarizing physicist (snapshot taken Jan 06, 2014):

### **Begin Quote**

#### **[Google Books Review: Scientific Writings By I. R. Durrani](#)**

#### **User reviews**

#### **User Review - Flag as inappropriate**

Mr Ehsan Leghari has involved himself in DMCA violation. The book is copyrighted in my name , and has an ISBNs 1906561087,9781906561086, attached to it yet the reviewer has the temerity to act in violation of the terms and conditions . The review may be deleted as being grossly inappropriate. Mr Ehsan Leghari has involved himself in criminal DMCA violation which is punishable under the law and has also torn to shreds the rules and regulations guide-lined by the estimable Search Engine Google. The review should be taken down as the chilling effect has also issued a cease and desist notice to that effect. Finally Mr Ehsan Leghari is Mr Zahir Ebrahim's protege , who has been maligning the author and the HEC, for reasons purely mundane as he could not get a slot as an HEC Visiting Faculty Member and was/is condemned to live as a carpetbagger across the pond. An anarchist to boot Mr ZE should

not let his Gehenna spillover on others. BTW: The list Mr Ehsan Leghari has provided in his blatantly malicious review is a particularly germane example of criminal imputation. The cease and desist notice has been enforced on the abominable review of Mr Ehsan Leghari below. The review is fallacious constituting criminal DMCA violation and it is requested that it be ripped off and the reviewer banished from the Google Group for having wilfully and with malafide intent torn to shreds the R&R pertaining to a viable review. Thanks

Dr. IR Durrani

The Author

### **User Review** - Flag as inappropriate

Excellent example of plagiarism taken to the EXTREME. About 99.95% of the whole book is straight-out copied from the work of others:

Chapter 1: An investigation of Time in Relativity

100% copied from SC Benzahra - 2002 paper of the same title

Chapter 2: Deviation of the Lorenz Force from Maxwell's Equations

100% copied from Valery P. Dmitriyev's 2002 paper titled "Can we derive the Lorentz force from Maxwell's equations?"

Chapter 3: Gravitation and electromagnetism

100% copied from Valery P Dmitriyev's 2002 paper of the same title

Chapter 4: The Relativistic Mass Increase and Classical Physics

100% copied from MV Lokajicek's 2007 paper titled "The velocity increase of mass and the classical physics"

Chapter 5: On the Concept of Mass in Relativity

100% stolen from P M Brown's 2007 paper of the same title

Chapter 6: The Role of the Two Postulates of Special Relativity

100% copied from Alfred Ziegler's 2007 paper of the same title

Chapter 7: How to Create a Universe

100% copied from Gordon McCabe's 2008 paper of the same title

Chapter 8: The Simple Complex Numbers

100% copied from Jaroslaw Zale 'sny's 2008 paper of the same title

Chapter 9: Creativity and the New Structure of Science

100% copied from Andrei Kirilyuk's 2004 paper of the same title

Chapter 10: The Last Scientific Revolution

100% copied from Andrei P. KIRILYUK's 2007 paper of the same title

Chapter 11: A Brief History of Economics

100% copy of Bikas K. Chakrabarti's 2007 paper with the full title "History of Economics: An Outsider's Account"

Chapter 12: Angst and the Stock Market

100% copy of 2006 paper by Mogens Jensen, etc. with the title "Fear and its Implications for Stock markets"

Chapter 13: Terrorism: An Attempt At Its Explanation

100% copy of 2005 paper by A. S. Elgazzar, etc. titled "On complex adaptive systems and terrorism"

Chapter 14: The Effect of Nuclear Terrorism (Fizzles)

100% copy of Theodore E. Liolios's 2002 paper of the same title

Chapter 15: On Reducing the Power of Terrorism: A Hint from Physics

100% Copy of S. Galam and A. Mauger's 2003 paper On reducing Terrorism Power: A Hint from Physics by

Chapter 16: Towards a New Democracy: Consensus Through Quantum Parliament

99.99% copy of Diederik Aerts' 2005 paper of the same title (99.99% because things like "We compare..." have been replaced "This chapter compares...")

Chapter 17: Mona Lisa -- Ineffable Smile of Quantum Mechanics

100% copied from 2003 paper by Slobodan Prvanovic of the same title

Oh, and btw, the "Introduction" comes mostly from The World of Physics: The Aristotelian Cosmos and the Newtonian System : The Einstein Universe and the Bohr Atom : The Evolutionary Cosmos and the Li, Volume 1 by Jefferson Hane Weaver, Lloyd Motz, Dale Mcadoo from 1987

Ehsan Leghari

Lahore, Pakistan

**End Quote**

Thank you.

Zahir Ebrahim

Project Humanbeingsfirst.org

California, United States,

**N.B.** [Is HEC planning to reinstate the plagiarist like it did once before? Letter to HEC from Zahir Ebrahim](#)

Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan By Zahir Ebrahim

**Related [1]:** [Zahir Ebrahim's Feedback Letter to HEC Chairman and Executive Director on their hare brained schemes, February 15, 2007](#)



Caption Zahir Ebrahim's Feedback Letter to Pakistan Academe's Brilliant Stewards, 15 February 2007: **'HEC - mes amis, is Alice in wonderland'**  
(image of Alice in Wonderland and cast of characters via wiki)

**Related [2]:** [Zahir Ebrahim's Letter to the Editor, The Chronicle of Higher Education, explaining the real agenda behind the borrowed monies so lavishly being spent by the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan in pursuit of its idiotic and absurd policies, March 12, 2007](#)

**Source URL:** <http://print-humanbeingsfirst.blogspot.com/2014/01/masterpiece-of-plagiarism-in-pakistan.html>

**Source PDF:** <https://sites.google.com/site/humanbeingsfirst/download-pdf/open-letter-masterpiece-of-plagiarism-in-pakistan-revisited.pdf>

**Full Report PDF as submitted to the Supreme Court of Pakistan:**

<https://sites.google.com/site/humanbeingsfirst/download-pdf/masterpiece-of-plagiarism-in-pakistan-report-recap.pdf>

Open Letter to the Academe of Pakistan on the Masterpiece of Plagiarism in Pakistan By Zahir Ebrahim



First emailed to Pakistani Academe on Monday, Jan 6, 2014 at 7:01 PM | Published as Open Letter on Monday, January 14, 2014 | Last Updated on Sun, December 20, 2015 10:00 AM  
4248